GEOGRAPHICAL VARIATIONS IN ALL-CAUSE MORTALITY IN THAILAND

Patarapan Odton¹, Chamnein Choonpradub² and Kanitta Bundhamcharoen¹

¹International Health Policy Program, Ministry of Public Health, Nonthaburi; ²Department of Mathematics and Computer Science, Faculty of Science and Technology, Prince of Songkla University, Pattani, Thailand

Abstract. In this study, we examined age-specific death rates among men and women from various districts in Thailand using mortality data from 1999 to 2001. A Poisson generalized linear model was used for analysis. To adjust for large variations in resident populations among districts, the 926 districts in Thailand were reduced to 235 "superdistricts" based on a minimum population of 200,000. The Poisson model incorporating additive factors for age-group and superdistrict generally provided a good fit for these data. The fitted mortality rates among the 235 superdistricts were compared with the overall means for each gender (637 per 100,000 for males and 415 per 100,000 for females). Thematic maps were created with three different colors signifying each superdistrict's mortality rate compared to the mean. Northeastern Thailand had higher than average mortality for both males and females. Lower than average death rates were found in southern Thailand with the exception of Phuket and Narathiwat, and in Bangkok, except for females in the superdistrict containing Nong Chok and Lat Krabang Districts. This modeling and mapping approach is a useful preliminary tool enabling public health planners to determine statistically valid geographical variations in mortality and to develop effective interventions.

Key words: all-cause mortality, Poisson regression, Thailand

INTRODUCTION

Some studies have investigated allcause mortality for the whole population (Myklebost, 1981; Nerbrand *et al*, 1985; Lee and Yoon, 1991; Langford and Bentham, 1996), while some studies have focused on cause-specific mortality, such as cardiovascular diseases (Fulton *et al*, 1978; Starrin

Tel: +66 (0) 7331 2179; Fax: +66 (0) 7331 2179 E-mail: cchamnein@bunga.pn.psu.ac.th *et al*, 1988; Douglas *et al*, 1990; Andersen and Commons, 2002; Filate *et al*, 2003), cancers (Hoogendoorn, 1983; Chen *et al*, 2003), traffic accidents (Clark and Cushing, 1999), and homicide (Vega-Lopez *et al*, 2003). Some studies have focused on causes of childhood mortality (Pattnayak and Shai, 1995; Treurniet *et al*, 2000; Laskar and Harada, 2005).

In Thailand, several studies have investigated regional variations in all-cause and cause-specific mortality. Faramnuayphol *et al* (2008) studied age-specific, cause-specific and all-cause mortality ratios at the district level. They found clustering of cause-specific mortality rates (SMR) in a

Correspondence: Chamnein Choonpradub, Department of Mathematics and Computer Science, Faculty of Science and Technology, Prince of Songkla University, Pattani 94000, Thailand.

single region for liver cancer (northeastern Thailand) and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (northern Thailand). A study by Lotrakul (2006) during 1998–2003 found suicide mortality rates were highest in northern, followed by central, southern, and northeastern Thailand.

Because the number of deaths is a nonnegative integer valued random variable, the Poisson regression model has been used to analyse mortality data (Lovett *et al*, 1986; Frome *et al*, 1990; Marsh *et al*, 1992; Vacchino, 1999). Brouhns *et al* (2002) analyzed Belgian mortality data using a generalized linear model, substituting the Poisson random variation for the number of deaths using an additive error term for the logarithm of the mortality rate. Delwarde *et al* (2006) used a Poisson logbilinear projection model for mortality data in G5 countries (France, Germany, Japan, UK and USA).

In this study, we have developed a statistical method for comparing mortality rates across geographical regions. The method involves first fitting a statistical model based on the Poisson distribution in which the age group and region are incorporated as factors. The estimated mortality rates and their 95% confidence intervals were used to produce thematic maps, so valid statistical conclusions can be made. Our illustrations begin with allcause mortality in Bangkok, then we extended the method to all of Thailand.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Gender-age-specific mortality data for 926 districts throughout Thailand during 1999-2001 were obtained from the vital registration database. This database was provided by the Bureau of Registration Administration, Ministry of the Interior and coded as cause-of-death using the tenth International Classification of Diseases (ICD-10) by the Bureau of Policy and Strategy, Ministry of Public Health.

The population denominators for gender, age group and district in Thailand were taken from the 2000 population and housing census conducted by the National Statistical Office (2002).

The district populations in Thailand vary substantially, ranging from 2,088 (in King Ko Kut, Trat Province) to 451,447 (Samut Prakan City). Therefore, we grouped contiguous districts into "superdistrict" with an approximate total population of 200,000 persons per "superdistrict". The districts were grouped into 235 superdistricts, with numbers ranging from one superdistrict covering 14 provinces (Ang Thong, Sing Buri, Chai Nat, Nakhon Nayok, Trat, Samut Songkham, Amnat Charoen, Mukdahan, Uthai Thani, Phang-Nga, Phuket, Ranong, Krabi and Satun) to 24 superdistricts in Bangkok Province.

Poisson model

The number of deaths (D_{ij}) per 100,000 population (E_{ij}) per superdistrict (*i*) (*i* = 1, 2, 3, ..., 235) by age group (*j*) (*j* = <1, 1-4, 5-9, ..., 80-84 years), were modeled using the Poisson generalized linear model (Venables and Ripley, 2002). This gave the following model:

$$\lambda_{ii} = E_{ii} \exp(\alpha_i + \beta_i), \quad (1)$$

where α_i is the district specific parameter, and β_j is the age-group parameter, one of which is redundant.

The contrast matrix used in the model was a "sum contrast"; each parameter estimate has a standard error enabling comparison with the mean (Venables and Ripley, 2002; Tongkumchum and McNeil, 2009).



Fig 1-Model results for all-cause mortality for males and females aged 0-84 years in Bangkok, 1999-2001.

A thematic map was produced based on the model results. Gender-specific death rates were used for comparison of mortality between geographical areas. The mortality rates for all such areas in the sample were then classified into three groups, according to whether the confidence interval was: 1. completely above the mean, 2. crossing the mean, or 3. completely below the mean. A thematic map was used to display this information using corresponding colors: red, orange, and blue. Statistically valid conclusions can be made using this map; the mortality rate for each red-colored district was greater than the average mortality, and the mortality rate for each blue-colored district was less than the average mortality.

All statistical modeling and graphical displays used R commands (R Development Core Team, 2008).

RESULTS

Different age- and gender-specific mortality rates for Bangkok and the four regions of Thailand during 1999-2001 are shown in Table 1. The average observed mortality rates were higher in males than females in all age groups.

Fig 1 shows the results of fitting model (1) to all-cause mortality for males and females aged 0 to 84 years in Bangkok Province. It is clear from the district-adjusted mortality rates by age-group (as shown in the left panel of Fig 1) the 80-84 year old age group had the highest mortality rate. The residual plots in the middle panel of Fig 1 indicate the models fit reasonably well, apart from 4 outliers in males and 7 outliers in females. The outliers in both males and females occurred in babies aged less than 1 year in Pathum Wan,

Gender	Age in years		National				
		Bangkok	Central	Northeast	North	South	
Males	<1	1,002	717	613	605	745	683
	1-4	86	167	114	153	141	134
	5-9	42	70	71	91	65	72
	10-14	40	57	45	56	54	51
	15-19	105	181	174	191	163	170
	20-24	150	270	313	386	265	285
	25-29	250	552	533	846	477	544
	30-34	370	680	592	1,010	529	653
	35-39	457	640	506	810	470	590
	40-44	506	623	513	736	445	578
	45-49	614	728	643	813	512	681
	50-54	773	924	908	992	669	887
	55-59	1,150	1,166	1,216	1,245	940	1,171
	60-64	1,725	1,724	1,767	1,767	1,398	1,705
	65-69	2,814	2,554	2,480	2,600	2,139	2,508
	70-74	3,672	3,627	3,727	3,932	3,208	3,674
	75-79	5,985	5,900	5,502	6,268	5,332	5,788
	80-84	8,878	9,081	8,593	9,577	8,009	8,867
Male aged	0-84	533	697	609	852	547	659
Females	<1	942	603	488	532	598	571
	1-4	74	144	95	151	120	118
	5-9	33	52	48	73	45	52
	10-14	20	38	32	41	37	35
	15-19	32	62	57	76	54	58
	20-24	47	116	130	223	96	124
	25-29	77	190	215	464	148	220
	30-34	98	197	201	373	161	213
	35-39	121	204	196	305	162	207
	40-44	175	250	239	317	178	244
	45-49	258	354	351	418	254	344
	50-54	375	485	538	576	355	495
	55-59	604	687	778	804	480	711
	60-64	945	1,029	1,193	1,212	749	1,078
	65-69	1,588	1,590	1,818	1,958	1,287	1,710
	70-74	2,379	2,479	2,780	2,969	2,034	2,612
	75-79	4,472	4,371	4,414	4,937	3,617	4,419
	80-84	6,794	7,423	7,510	8,300	6,084	7,375
Female aged	0-84	303	424	410	565	316	419
Person aged	0-84	412	558	509	707	431	537

Table 1Mortality rates (per 100,000 population) by gender, age and region, Thailand, 1999-2001.



Fig 2-All-cause mortality for males and females aged less than 85 years in Bangkok, Thailand 1999-2001.

Ratchathewi, Khan Na Yao and Khlong San districts. The fitted and observed numbers of deaths are plotted in the right panel of Fig 1.

The age-adjusted male and female mortality rates and their 95% confidence

intervals for each district are shown in the top panel of Fig 2, where the horizontal solid lines denote the average mortality rates (533 per 100,000 for males and 303 per 100,000 for females). The horizontal dotted lines correspond to the overall



Din Daeng 10 Bang Sue, Chatuchak 4 Dusit, PhayaThai 5 Bangkok Noi, 11 Taling Chan, Bang Phlat Phasi Charoen





Fig 3-All-cause mortality for males and females aged less than 85 years across 24 superdistricts in Bangkok, Thailand 1999-2001.

Chom Thong



Fig 4-Model results for all-cause mortality for (a) males and (b) females aged less than 85 years across 235 superdistricts in Thailand, 1999-2001.

morality rates for males and females combined (412 per 100,000). The maps of 50 districts in Bangkok show male and female mortality (lower panel of Fig 2); the confidence intervals classify the districts. If the confidence interval was entirely above the gender-specific mean then the district is red, if the confidence interval crosses the gender-specific mean, the district is orange, and if the confidence interval is entirely below the mean, the district is blue. There were eleven districts (Nong Chok, Min Buri, Lat Krabang, Prawet, Rat Burana, Chom Thong, Phasi Charoen, Bang Khae, Nong Khaem, Bang Bon and Bang Khun Thian) in Bangkok where mortality rates were significantly higher than average for both males and females.

Fig 3 shows the same results as Fig 2 using superdistricts instead of districts, after the 50 districts in Bangkok were reduced to 24 superdistricts.

The 95% confidence intervals of ageadjusted mortality rates for the 24 superdistricts, as shown in the upper panel of Fig 3 are smaller than those in Fig 2. Maps in the lower panel of Fig 3 indicate that there were seven superdistricts located in eastern and southwestern Bangkok having higher mortality than the gender-specific mean for both males and females.

Fig 4 shows the district-adjusted mortality rates, residuals plots and plots of observed and fitted deaths after fitting the Poisson model to all-cause mortality for the whole of Thailand, with 926 districts reduced to 235 superdistricts. The highest residuals for both males and females occurred in babies aged less than 1 year in the superdistrict in Bangkok containing Pathum Wan and Ratchathewi Districts.

The 95% confidence intervals of ageadjusted mortality rates in the 235



Fig 5-All-cause mortality rates for males and females aged less than 85 years in Thailand, 1999-2001.

superdistricts were compared with the averages (659 per 100,000 for males and 418 per 100,000 for females) to produce the thematic maps in Fig 5. Most superdistricts in the northern region and some superdistricts in the northern part of the northeastern region had higher mortality than the average for both males and females. The superdistricts in southern Thailand had lower than average mortality except for Phuket and Narathiwat. All superdistricts in Bangkok had lower mortality than average except for females in the superdistrict containing Nong Chok and Lat Krabang Districts.

The highest mortality rate for males occurred in the superdistrict in Chiang Rai containing Phan, Mae Suai and Wiang Pa Pao Districts. The superdistrict in Chiang Rai containing Wiang Chai, Thoeng, Pa Daet, Phaya Mengrai and Khun Tan Districts had the highest mortality rate among females in Thailand. The top ten superdistricts with the highest age-adjusted mortality rates for males and females are shown in Table 2 (individual rankings of superdistricts available from the author).

DISCUSSION

The Poisson model incorporating additive factors for age-group and district generally provides a good fit to mortality data in Thailand because the standardized residuals were randomly dispersed along

Ran	k Males		Females		
Null	Superdistrict	Mortality per 100,000 (95% CI)	Superdistrict	Mortality per 100,000 (95% CI)	
1	Phan, Mae Suai, Wiang PaPao (Chiang Rai)	1,127 (1,096-1,159)	Wiang Chai, Thoeng, Pa Daet, Phaya Mengrai, Khun Tan (Chiang Rai)	844 (813-876)	
2	Mueang Phayao, Dok Khamtai, Mae Chai, Phu Kamyao (Phayao)	1,106 (1,076-1,137)	Fang, Mae Ai, Chai Prakan (Chiang Mai)	836 (804-869)	
3	Fang, Mae Ai, Chai Prakan (Chiang Mai)	1,095 (1,061-1,131)	Chun, Chiang Kham, Chiang Muan, Pong, Phu Sang (Phayao)	807 (778,838)	
4	Chun, Chiang Kham, Chiang Muan, Pong, Phu Sang (Phayao)	1,089 (1,056-1,123)	Phan, Mae Suai, Wiang Pa Pao (Chiang Rai)	799 (773-827)	
5	Wiang Chai, Thoeng, Pa Daet, Phaya Mengrai, Khun Tan (Chiang Rai)	1,083 (1,049-1,117)	Chiang Dao, Mae Taeng, Phrao, Wiang Haeng (Chiang Mai)	759 (730-790)	
6	Mae Rim, Samoeng, San Sai (Chiang Mai)	1,081 (1,045-1,118)	Mueang Chiang Rai, Mae Lao (Chiang Rai)	753 (724-783)	
7	Mueang Phrae, Rong Kwang, Song, Nong Muang Khai (Phrae)	1,075 (1,045-1,107)	Mueang Phayao, Dok Khamtai, Mae Chai, Phu Kamyao (Phayao	744 o) (719-770)	
8	Mueang Chiang Rai, Mae Lao (Chiang Rai)	1,070 (1,037-1,105)	Chiang Khong, Chiang Saen, Wieng Kaen, Wieng Chiang Run Doi Luang (Chiang Rai)	744 ng, (711-778)	
9	San Pa Tong, Hang Dong, Mae Wang, Doi Lo (Chiang Mai)	1,066 (1,034-1,100)	Doi Saket, San Kamphaeng, Saraphi, Mae On (Chiang Mai)	710 (685-736)	
10	Chiang Dao, Mae Taeng, Phrao, Wiang Haeng (Chiang Mai)	1,050 (1,017-1,084)	Mae Rim, Samoeng, San Sai (Chiang Mai)	710 (680-741)	

Table 2Top 10 superdistricts with highest age-adjusted mortality rates in males and females,
Thailand 1999-2001.

a straight line in the deviance residuals plots, as shown in the middle panel of Fig 4.

This study illustrates the applications of the Poisson GLM for all-cause mortality rates in Bangkok at district and superdistrict levels. Superdistricts were more effective regional divisions than districts because they provided cells with approximately equal populations, thus equalizing the standard error of the estimated effects, as shown in the upper panels of Fig 2 and 3. Using 235 superdistricts instead of 926 districts decreased the standard error by a factor of nearly 2. The 926 districts for Thailand were difficult to distinguish, but the 235 superdistricts provided a clearer schematic map. The statistical model used in this study can be applied to analyze cause-specific mortality. However, a more appropriate model for comparing cause-specific mortality across a region is based on the proportions of cause-specific deaths to allcause deaths, and the methods used in this study can be extended directly to this situation by using logistic instead of Poisson regression.

Our finding of high age-adjusted morality rates in the northern and northeastern regions may be related to socio-economic factors and excessive mortality due to specific causes, such as HIV/AIDS in the northern and liver cancer in the northeastern regions. Regional variations in causespecific mortality need to be investigated further.

In this paper we have developed a statistical method for comparing mortality rates across geographical regions. The method involves first fitting a statistical model based on Poisson distribution in which age group and region are incorporated as factors. This model gives age-adjusted mortality rates for each geographical division, and corresponds to the method of computing standardized mortality rates (SMRs) commonly used in demographic research. Its advantage over the SMR-based method is that it routinely provides standard errors for adjusted incidence rates, and thus facilitates comparison of both regions and age groups. The differences in mortality rates across superdistricts in different age groups reflect underlying factors that need further study. Potential factors worth investigation include risk behavior patterns, levels of health resources, and social determinants of health.

The model can also be used to produce color-coded thematic maps containing just three colors. These are obtained when the model is fitted using sum contrasts, thus giving confidence intervals for comparing the incidence rate in each region with gender-specific mean incidence rate, and then classifying these regions according to whether their confidence intervals are above, at or below the mean.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study was supported by the Health Information System Development Office, under the Thailand Burden of Disease Project. We would like to express our gratitude to Don McNeil for his helpful assistance.

REFERENCES

- Andersen LD, Commons JL. Regional variations in coronary heart disease mortality in Wisconsin, 1979-1998. *Wisconsin Med J* 2002; 101: 16-22.
- Brouhns N, Deuit M, Vermunt JK. A Poisson log-bilinear regression approach to the construction of projected lifetables. *Insur: Math Econ* 2002; 31: 373-93.
- Chen KX, Wang PP, Zhang SW, Li LD, Lu FZ, Hao XS. Regional variations in mortality rates of pancreatic cancer in China: results from 1990-1992 national mortality survey. *World J Gastroenterol* 2003; 9: 2557-60.
- Clark DE, Cushing BM. Predicting regional variations in mortality from motor vehicle crashes. *Acad Emerg Med* 1999; 6: 125-30.
- Delwarde A, Denuit M, Guillen M, Vidiella-i-Anguera. Application of the Poisson logbilinear projection model to the G5 mortality experience. *Belg Actuar Bull* 2006; 6: 54-68.
- Douglas AS, Russell D, Allan TM. Seasonal, regional and secular variations of cardiovascular and cerebrovascular mortality in New Zealand. *Aust NZJ Med* 1990; 20: 669-76.
- Faramnuayphol P, Chongsuvivatwong V, Pannarunothai S. Geographical variation

of mortality in Thailand. *J Med Assoc Thai* 2008; 91: 1455-60.

- Filate WA, Johansen HL, Kennedy CC, Tu JV. Regional variations in cardiovascular mortality in Canada. *Can J Cardiol* 2003; 19: 1241-8.
- Frome EL, Cragle DL, McLain RW. Poisson regression analysis of the mortality among a cohort of World War II nuclear industry workers. *Radiat Res* 1990; 123: 138-52.
- Fulton M, Adams W, Lutz W, Oliver MF. Regional variations in mortality from ischaemic heart and cerebrovascular disease in Britain. *Br Heart J* 1978; 40: 563-8.
- Hoogendoorn D. Regional variations in cancer mortality. *Ned Tijdschr Geneeskd* 1983; 127: 1516-25.
- Jones AP, Haynes R, Kennedy V, Harvey IM, Jewell T, Lea D. Geographical variations in mortality and morbidity from road traffic accidents in England and Wales. *Health Place* 2008; 14: 519-35.
- Langford IH, Bentham G. Regional variations in mortality rates in England and Wales: an analysis using multi-level modelling. *Soc Sci Med* 1996; 42: 897-908.
- Laskar MS, Harada N. Trends and regional variations in infant mortality rates in Japan, 1973-1998. *Public Health* 2005; 119: 659-63.
- Lee S, Yoon BJ. Regional and monthly variations in mortality. *J Popul Health Soc Welfare* 1991; 11: 82-99.
- Lotrakul M. Suicide in Thailand during the period 1998-2003. *Psychiatry Clin Neurosci* 2006; 60: 90-5.
- Lovett AA, Bentham CG, Flowerdew R. Analysing geographic variations in mortality using Poisson regression: the example of ischaemic heart disease in England and Wales 1969-1973. *Soc Sci Med* 1986; 23: 935-43.
- Marsh GM, Stone RA, Henderson VL. Lung cancer mortality among industrial work-

ers exposed to formaldehyde: a Poisson regression analysis of the National Cancer Institute Study. *Am Ind Hyg Assoc J* 1992; 53: 681-91.

- Myklebost H. Regional variations of mortality in Norway. *Fennia* 1981; 159: 153-63.
- National Statistical Office. The 2000 population and housing census. Bangkok: Statistical Data Bank and Information Dissemination Division, National Statistical Office, 2002.
- Nerbrand C, Aberg H, Rosen M, Tibblin G. Regional mortality variations in middle Sweden. *Lakartidningen* 1985; 82: 4004-8.
- Pattnayak SR, Shai D. Mortality rates as indicators of cross-cultural development: regional variations in the Third World. *J Dev Soc* 1995; 11: 252-62.
- R Development Core Team. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. 2008. Vienna: R Foundation for Statistical Computing . [Cited 2009 Nov 18]. Available from: URL: <u>http://www.R-project.org</u>
- Starrin B, Larsson G, Brenner SO. Regional variations in cardiovascular mortality in Sweden-structural vulnerability in the local community. *Soc Sci Med* 1988; 27: 911-7.
- Tongkumchum P, McNeil D. Confidence intervals using contrasts for regression model. *Songklanakarin J Sci Technol* 2009; 31: 151-6.
- Treurniet HF, Looman CW, van der Maas PJ, Mackenbach JP. Regional trend variations in infant mortality due to perinatal conditions in the Netherlands. *Eur J Obstet Gynecol Reprod Biol* 2000; 91: 43-9.
- Vacchino MN. Poisson regression in mapping cancer mortality. *Environ Res* 1999; 81: 1-17.
- Vega-Lopez MG, Gonzalez-Perez GJ, Munoz de la Torre A, Barbosa AV, Cabrera PC, Quintero-Vega PP. Regional variations in homicide mortality in Jalisco, Mexico. *Cad Saude Publica* 2003; 19: 613-23.
- Venables WN, Ripley BD. Modern applied statistics with S. 4th ed. New York: Springer-Verlag, 2002.